



## “Pre-Qualification of Survey Firms”

### Proposal Evaluation Criteria

Once all firms that have submitted required information and are compliant to the terms laid out in the pre-qualification, will be evaluated according to the following criteria:

	Max Score
Experience & Standing	20
Personnel	80

**Any firm scoring less than 65 shall not be shortlisted.**

#### A. Experience & Standing

Experience and standing shall be calculated on projects previously completed amounting to Rs. 10 Million

		Relative Size of Assignment		
		80% or more	50-80%	Less than 50%
Similarity	Strong	1	0.65	0.3
	Medium	0.63	0.4225	0.195
	Weak	0.3	0.195	0.09

Component Score=Weight from table x 20 (max score)

#### B. Personnel

The total marks for this section will be divided between proposed experts in equal proportions. Any experts with level of qualification below bachelors shall be excluded from the evaluation. Each expert proposed by the firm will be evaluated out of 100 on his/her relevant practical experience in a similar type of consultancy assignment:

	<b>Max score</b>
Educational qualifications	20
Number of years working on similar assignments	50
Number of projects on which similar tasks have been undertaken	30



# LAHORE TRANSPORT COMPANY



For educational qualifications, 20 points will be awarded for the post-graduate or doctoral degree or equivalent, 18 points for Masters Degree or equivalent and 16 points for bachelor's degree or equivalent. 0 points will be given for any degree below bachelors.

A maximum of 50 will be awarded for 10 years experience in the relevant field, i.e. 5 per year. A maximum of 30 will be awarded for working in 5 projects of a similar nature, i.e. 6 marks per project.

The total score for the CV will be added up to get T, after which the component score will be calculated as follows:

$$\text{Component Score} = (T/100) \times 80$$



LTC

LAHORE TRANSPORT COMPANY



Ref: LTC/PLG-EOI-SUR/2013/02  
Dated: 6-01-14

## NOTE FOR APPROVAL

SUBJECT: EVALUATION FOR PRE-QUALIFICATION OF SURVEY FIRMS

1. Pre-Qualification advertisement:
  - Advertisement attached as an Annexure I.
  - Last date for submission of pre-qualification documents was given as December 05, 2013, time and venue for opening of pre-qualification documents was at 11:00 AM on December 09, 2103, in LTC office.
2. Opening of pre-Qualification documents:
  - Meeting of tender committee for opening of Pre-qualification documents was held at 02:00 PM on December 09, 2013. The attendance sheet containing signature of the committee members is attached (Annexure-II)
  - Pre-qualification documents were opened in presence of tender committee. The following ten (10) companies/ firms submitted pre-qualification documents for urban & sub-urban route survey.
    1. M/S EA Consulting Pvt. Ltd.
    2. M/s SAMPAK International (PVT) Ltd.
    3. M/s AAA Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd.
    4. M/s Engineering Consultants International Pvt. Ltd.
    5. M/s Tariq Abdul Ghani Maqbool & Co
    6. M/s Master Consulting Engineers (Pvt.) Ltd.
    7. Pakistan Environmental Planning & Architectural Consultants (PVT) Ltd.
    8. M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (PVT.) Ltd
    9. M/s Engineering Services UET Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd.
    10. M/s Nielsen Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd
3. Technical evaluation of pre-qualification documents:
  - A sub-committee comprising of the following members was constituted and assigned the task to conduct technical evaluation of the Pre-Qualification documents by tender committee. Names and designation of the sub-committee members are as follows;
    1. Syed Mubasher Gillani (Transport Planner, Planning)
    2. Ismat Zahra (Assistant Manager, Planning)
  - Sub-committee requested two (02) days for complete technical evaluation of the submitted Pre-qualification documents.

4<sup>th</sup> Floor, 97-B-D/I, Engineering Center, Liberty Roundabout, Gulberg-III, Lahore  
Phone: +92-42-35782764 – 66, Fax: +92-42-35782763, Web: [www.ltc.gop.pk](http://www.ltc.gop.pk), e-mail: [info@ltc.gop.pk](mailto:info@ltc.gop.pk)



#### 4. Results of Technical Evaluation of Pre-qualification of survey firms

- Following the above, sub-committee remained in session to conduct the technical evaluation of the pre-qualification documents. The technical qualification criteria is given in pre-qualification document (Annexure-III)
- In initial assessment on non submission of documents, **M/s AC Nielsen Pakistan (Pvt.) Ltd. (Missing Documents: Registration with securities and exchange commission or Registrar of Firm, Registration with Relevant Professional Institution, Audited statement of accounts for last 5 years, Undertaking of firm regarding black listing, Management profile of Survey Firm)** and **M/s Pakistan Environmental Planning & Architectural Consultants (Pvt.) Ltd. (Missing Documents: Audited statement of accounts for last 5 year)** were considered non-responsive and excluded from evaluation.
- As a result of technical evaluation of pre-qualification documents, Two (02) firms namely **M/s Engineering Consultant International (Pvt.) Ltd.** and **Master Consulting Engineers Pvt. Ltd.** were disqualified because these firms obtained less than 65 marks in technical evaluation. Six (06) prospective firms were shortlisted as per the technical evaluation criteria and results of the technical evaluation conducted by the sub-committee are attached (Annexure-IV).

#### 5. Recommendation of the sub-committee

- After technical evaluation of pre-qualification documents by the sub-committee, six (06) prospective firms were shortlisted and presented before the tender committee for approval to public the short listing and issuance of RFP documents.

Name	Designation	Signature	Date
Mr. Omar Pirzada	COO/ Chairman Tender Committee Planning		_____
Zafar Ahmed	DGM Finance		_____
Sara Khan	DGM Planning		_____
Faisal Nisar	DGM Operation		_____
Badie Khan	DGM IT		_____
Abid Hussain	Manager Coordination		_____
Kamran Shuja	Manager Legal		6/11/2014



# LAHORE TRANSPORT COMPANY



Sr. No.	Name of Firm	Experience & Standing	Personnel	Total	Remarks
		Max (20)	Max (80)		
1	M/s AAA Engineering Consultants (Pvt) Ltd	13.00	71.20	84.20	Qualified
2	M/S EA Consulting Pvt Ltd	13.00	70.80	83.80	Qualified
3	M/s Engineering Services UET Pakistan (PVT) LTD (ESUPAK)	6.00	73.60	79.60	Qualified
4	M/s National Engineering Services Pakistan (PVT) LTD. (NESPAC)	3.90	68.80	72.70	Qualified
5	M/s SAMPAC International (PVT) LTD	3.90	61.60	65.50	Qualified
6	M/S Tariq Aqbdul Ghani Maqbool & Co.	20.00	45.00	65.00	Qualified
7	M/s Master Consulting Engineers (PVT) LTD	13.00	48.60	61.60	Disqualified
8	M/s Engineering Consultants International Pvt. Ltd.	13.00	27.20	40.20	Disqualified
9	Pakistan Environmental Planning & Architectural Consultants (PVT) LTD	-	-	-	Non-Responsive (Audited Accounts not provided)
10	M/s AC Nielsen Pakistan (Pvt) Ltd	-	-	-	Non-Responsive(Registration Audited Statements, undertaking not provided)